

# **PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION**

**December 16, 2016**

## **Regular Meeting**

A regular meeting of the City Planning Commission was held this day at 9 A.M. in the J. Martin Griesel Room of Two Centennial Plaza with the following members present: Chair Daniel Driehaus, Mr. Byron Stallworth, City Manager Harry Black, Dr. Rainer vom Hofe, and Councilmember Amy Murray. Mr. Ronald Koettters and Mr. John Schneider were absent.

Also in attendance were Mr. Marion Haynes, legal counsel, and Department of City Planning staff: Mr. Charles C. Graves III, Ms. Rachel Culley, Mr. Jared Ellis, Mr. James Weaver, Ms. Stacey Hoffman, Ms. Ann Marie Kerby, Ms. Caroline Kellam, and Ms. Bonnie Holman.

Mr. Driehaus called the meeting to order and asked everyone to join in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mr. Driehaus stated that there was one speaker for Item 6 and made the motion for the item to be moved to the Discussion Agenda.

### **The Commission approved moving Item 6 to the Discussion Agenda.**

Mr. Driehaus made the motion, which Ms. Murray seconded.

Aye: Mr. Black, Mr. vom Hofe, Ms. Murray, Mr. Stallworth, and Mr. Driehaus.

## **Consent Agenda - Legislative**

**Item 1** was a report and recommendation on a proposed easement above Magnolia Street for a second floor balcony on the property at 1421-1423 Elm Street in Over-the-Rhine. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

**Item 2** was a report and recommendation on proposed aerial easements for the building under construction located at 1507-1519 Race Street in Over-the-Rhine. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

**Item 3** was a report and recommendation on a proposed easement of City-owned right-of-way across from Windisch Avenue between the properties located at 1236 and 1262 Tannehill Lane in Mount Lookout. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

**Item 4** was a report and recommendation on the sale of approximately 0.135 acres of City-owned property to 1784 Dreman, LLC, at 1784 Dreman Avenue in South Cumminsville. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

**Item 5** was a report and recommendation on the acceptance of the donation of real property located at 1874 Dreman Avenue in South Cumminsville. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

**Item 7** was a report and recommendation on the sale of two portions of Theodore M. Berry right-of-way between Elm Street and Race Street and between Race Street and Rosa Parks Street in Downtown. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

**The Commission adopted staff's recommendations for the Legislative Consent Agenda.**

Mr. Stallworth made the motion, which Ms. Murray seconded.

Aye: Mr. Black, Mr. vom Hofe, Ms. Murray, Mr. Stallworth, and Mr. Driehaus.

**Consent Agenda – Quasi-Judicial**

**Item 8** was a report and recommendation on the proposed demolition of an existing structure at 902 Mt. Hope Avenue within Interim Development Control (IDC) Overlay District No. 80, Incline District Investment Area in East Price Hill. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

**By Leave Consent Agenda – Quasi-Judicial**

**Item 10** was a report and recommendation on a Dedication Plat for Grandin View Subdivision in Hyde Park. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

**The Commission adopted staff's recommendations for the Quasi-Judicial Consent Agenda Item 8 and the By Leave Consent Agenda Item 10.**

Mr. vom Hofe made the motion, which Mr. Black seconded.

Aye: Mr. Black, Mr. vom Hofe, Ms. Murray, Mr. Stallworth, and Mr. Driehaus.

**Discussion Agenda- Quasi-Judicial**

Ms. Culley presented **Item 6**, a report and recommendation for the sale of City-owned property located at MetroWest Commerce Park in Lower Price Hill to Nehemiah Manufacturing Company, LLC. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

Mr. Ed Hottinger, property owner of 801 Evans Street, stated that he was concerned about the truck traffic, the one-foot easement that abuts Evans Street, and parking.

Mr. Robert Bertsch, of the Department of Community and Economic Development stated that the City owned the property, which was formerly known as Queen City Barrel, since the early 2000's. He said the property had been on the market for five years and the Nehemiah Manufacturing Company, LLC, wanted to purchase approximately 7.2 acres. Nehemiah's new facility would need to have a vapor barrier installed to protect those occupying the building from potentially harmful vapors. This cost of this vapor barrier system was estimated at approximately \$450,000 and would be an additional construction expense. The City agreed to sell the property to Nehemiah for \$1 in exchange for Nehemiah paying for the necessary vapor barrier system to construct their facility. He said traffic for the site would be on Evans, Summer, and Gest Streets. Employee parking and docks would be in the rear of the buildings.

**The Commission adopted staff's recommendations for Item 6 on the Legislative Discussion Agenda.**

Mr. Black made the motion, which Mr. Stallworth seconded.

Aye: Mr. Black, Mr. vom Hofe, Ms. Murray, Mr. Stallworth, and Mr. Drieaus.

Ms. Kellam presented **Item 9**, a report and recommendation on a proposed zone change at 2108 and 2124 Winchell Avenue from MG (Manufacturing General) to ML (Manufacturing Limited) in the West End. Department of City Planning staff recommended approval.

Mr. Sean Suder, of Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP, the attorney representing the owner, stated that they had been working on the project for some time. He thanked Department of City Planning staff Caroline Kellam and Katherine Keough-Jurs and said that the St. Vincent de Paul project was important for the West End community. The new facility would offer the same services provided at the current St. Vincent de Paul such as a food pantry, drugstore, dental and eye clinic, library, and computer room. The building would have a larger waiting room, eliminating the need for lines forming out on the sidewalk. The new facility would also have expanded hours enabling customers to receive all or most services needed on the same day.

Mr. Tim Haines, West End property and business owner at 2145 Central Parkway, stated that he was opposed to the project because there were already too many social service agencies in the West End.

Ms. Crystal Kendrick, West End property owner, stated that property values in the West End were decreasing and banks were unwilling to give loans in her neighborhood. She said she opposed any additional social service agencies for the West End.

Ms Linda Petersen, of 808 Dayton Street, stated that the new St. Vincent de Paul facility would increase the number of people it served. She said that the neighborhood was saturated with social service agencies and other neighborhoods should have their share. She said that their facility serves people from all over the tristate area and the numbers cited in their reports were smaller than the reality.

Mr. John Donaldson, Klotter Street resident, stated that the area should be reserved for manufacturing general businesses that pay taxes to the City and provide jobs. The West End used to have businesses and now has too many social service agencies.

Rev. Reynaldo S. Taylor, of St. Joseph Catholic Church, said that St. Vincent de Paul had been serving the City of Cincinnati for almost 150 years and was needed now more than ever.

Rev. Barry M. Windholtz, of St. Peter in Chains Cathedral, said that St. Vincent de Paul had been a good neighbor and provided much needed services. He said that the new facility would provide a larger waiting room so that people would not have to wait outside in inclement weather.

Ms. Liz Carter, President and CEO of Scripps Howard Foundation, told the story of an elderly lady that went to St. Vincent de Paul for insulin after a hospital stay. The new St. Vincent de Paul facility would increase waiting room capacity so that elderly, sick, and handicapped people would not have to wait out on the sidewalk in the hot sun or freezing weather. People would be able to have all of their needs met in one visit instead of having to return on different days. She urged the City Planning Commission members to approve the zone change.

Ms. Andrea Rosado, of 1125 Bank Street, said that she was a product of St. Vincent de Paul and had volunteered there for one year working with people in the neighborhood. She said that she was currently in medical school and was still volunteering. She asked that the City Planning Commission members approve the zone change.

Mr. Ron Christian, member of the St. Vincent de Paul Board and Pharmacy Board, stated that the St. Vincent de Paul pharmacy provides medicine to people who have no other options. Without them, people would have to choose between rent and food or medicine. He said that they would be able to provide better services in the new building. He asked that the City Planning Commission members approve the zone change.

Ms. Becky Catino, Chair of the Society Board, said that she was drawn to St. Vincent de Paul because of how they are neighbors helping neighbors. She said that many people have homes and jobs but just need a hand up and not a hand out. It would be heartbreaking to turn people away.

Ms. Princess Davis, City of Cincinnati Police Officer, said that she was currently on medical leave, and had been a West End Community Officer since 1993. She said she was there to support the St. Vincent de Paul zone change so that elderly people would not have to go to the old small building and have to wait outside.

Dr. Michel Jennings, a physician at Christ Hospital for over 30 years, said that many of his patients had received medication from St. Vincent de Paul. He said that they had support from the neighborhood. He said that the need for a pharmacy had increased and many people could not afford medication.

Ms. Lucy Crane, Director of United Way of Greater Cincinnati, Stated that she supported the zone change. She said that St. Vincent de Paul was the most impactful agency for people in poverty. They provide a strong leadership role and have improved the neighborhood.

Ms. Sarah Spech, resident and current St. Vincent de Paul volunteer, said that the new facility would provide expanded hours for the food pantry and other services. She said that people who ride the bus would benefit by receiving all of their services on the same day.

Ms. Amelia Rydell and Sister Sally Duffy, of SC Ministry Foundation, said that they collaborated with St. Vincent de Paul to move people out of poverty.

Ms. Tia Brown, West End resident, and member of Bright Start Church, said that she had situations when she had to use St. Vincent emergency services. She said she supported the zone change.

Mr. John Spencer, Cincinnati businessman and member of the West End Community Council, said that he had donated over 1,000 hours of volunteer services to St. Vincent de Paul and the expansion of services and hours would help neighbors.

Ms. Betty Grippin, said that she had heard stories similar to hers. She said that she went to St. Vincent de Paul with her sister and had to get there at 6:00 A.M. and wait in line. She saw a man waiting that was sick, because he had no medicine or food. She saw many people that came on buses. She said they were people that needed a hand up and not causing crime. She said that the new building would help people.

Mr. Driehaus stated that there were more people waiting to speak in support of the St. Vincent de Paul zone change. He said he was worried that they would no longer have a quorum with so many left to speak. He read off their names and said he was very grateful that they had come. He said that he believed St. Vincent de Paul needed the new facility and that he was proud to support the zone change.

At 10:40 A.M. Mr. Haynes left the meeting and Mr. Andrew Garth arrived to take his place.

**The Commission adopted staff's recommendations for Item 9 on the Legislative Discussion Agenda.**

Ms. Murray made the motion, which Mr. vom Hofe seconded.

Aye: Mr. Black, Mr. vom Hofe, Ms. Murray, Mr. Stallworth, and Mr. Driehaus.

**Director's Report**

Mr. Graves told the City Planning Commission Members that he had traveled to Beijing, China and Barcelona, Spain representing the American Planning Association. He said that he had also shared all of the great things that happened in the City of Cincinnati.

Mr. Graves said that he was proud of what had been accomplished by the City Planning Commission and the Department of City Planning in the year 2016.

Ms. Murray asked that in the future if meetings ran past noon, like the meeting on December 2, 2016, that something was put in place to order lunch in. Mr. Black said that he would ensure that happened.

The meeting adjourned at 10:55 A.M.



Charles C. Graves, III, Director  
Department of City Planning

Date: 2/3/17



Daniel Driehaus, Chair  
City Planning Commission

Date: 2/3/17